

## Transnational Judicial Cooperation

Hon. John Tunheim Chief Judge, U.S. District Court for the District of Minnesota



## Outline

- 1. UN Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime
- 2. Types of Transnational Judicial Cooperation
  - Treaties
    - Mutual Legal Assistance
    - Extradition
  - Letters Rogatory
  - Informal
- 3. Challenges
  - Differences in legal traditions
  - Dual criminality
  - Delays



#### THE TRANSNATIONAL NATURE OF

## Human Trafficking

- Activities and/individuals in multiple jurisdictions
  - Difficult to investigate and prosecute
  - Trial proceeding delays
- Evidence
  - More easily concealedDifferences in national laws, i.e., privacy
- Tracing money flow
  - Funds move across borders





U.N. Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime

- Global
- Developed to encourage national authorities to work together to combat and prosecute transnational organized crime
- Signatories obligated to cooperate internationally
- Over 160 States parties - India joined in 2011
- One primary focus: international legal assistance

#### UNITED NATIONS CONVENTION AGAINST TRANSNATIONAL ORGANIZED CRIME AND THE PROTOCOLS THERETO





#### **TYPES OF TRANSNATIONAL JUDICIAL COOPERATION**

## Mutual Legal Assistance

Process by which States seek and assist with gathering evidence for use in criminal cases

- Challenges
  - Lengthy process
  - Differences in legal traditions



Protocol of Exchange of the Instrument of Ratification on Mutual Legal Assistance Treaty (MLAT) in New Delhi on October 03, 2005. Image Courtesy: *Gazette of India* 



#### CHAT #1 TYPE YOUR ANSWER IN THE CHAT BOX

Your court was asked to issue a Letters Rogatory, under Section 166A of the Criminal Procedure Code, in a human trafficking case

The prosecutor requested access the email accounts of a U.S. citizen implicated in the investigation.

What questions should you pose to the prosecution?



#### **TYPES OF TRANSNATIONAL JUDICIAL COOPERATION**

## Extradition

**Treaty-based** 

Non-treaty-based requests





#### CHAT #2 TYPE YOUR ANSWER IN THE CHAT BOX

What information must a judge consider before granting an extradition request from a foreign county?



### TYPES OF TRANSNATIONAL JUDICIAL COOPERATION Letters Rogatory

Letters rogatory are formal requests from a court in which an action is pending, to a foreign court to perform some judicial act.

Examples:

- Requests for the taking of evidence
- Serving of a summons, subpoenas, or other legal notice
- Execution of a civil judgement





# TYPES OF TRANSNATIONAL JUDICIAL COOPERATION

Direct contact with law enforcement or other counterparts





## Practical Challenges

- Ambiguity in the law
- Delays
  - MLAT can take ~1yrLetters rogatory >1yr
- Incomplete responses to information requests
- Conditions attached to the shared information





#### **DIFFERENCES IN**

## Legal Systems

- Terminology: affidavit, writ, commission rogatory, process-veral
- **Authorities:** roles and functions of investigating judge, police, lawyers
- Extradition requests
  - Role of Executive vs. Judiciary
  - Prima facie case
- Differences in law regarding
  - Admissibility of witness statements
  - Evidentiary standards
  - Judgements in absentia
  - Non-extradition of nationals
  - Dual criminality





TRANSNATIONAL JUDICIAL COOPERATION

## Best Practices

#### **INSTRUCTIONS:**

- In a few moments, we will put up a **Mentimeter screen** prompting you to submit **one** suggestion of a good case management practice.
- If you haven't already, please **log into Mentimeter** using the QR code or by going to **menti.com** and entering the code for this presentation.
- All you have to do is **type your response**, hit submit, and we will read responses as they come in.





#### **CEELI Institute, o.p.s**

Havlíčkovy Sady 58 120 00 Prague office@ceeli.eu Tel: +420 222 520 100



#### **Federal Judicial Center**

1 Columbus Circle NE Washington, DC 20002 ijr@fjc.gov Tel: 1-202-502-4000